

The Performance of the Provincial Government (2013-18) in the Health Department of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa in the Terms of the Allocated Budget

Dr. Muhammad Ibrahim¹

Mr. Umar Zada²

Miss. Saleema Khattak³

Abstract

In the current study, the performance of the provincial government of KP (2013-18) in connection with the public satisfaction in terms of the allocated budget to health department is investigated. This study revealed that the level of public satisfaction is up to an average extent (37.39%) that portrays performance of an average extent of the provincial government in terms of the allocated budget to the health department in the province. The primary data was collected from the public and experts from the health department through a questionnaire by using simple random technique. The number of respondents from the district Charsadda and Peshawar were selected by using Yamane formula. The analysis has been made by SPSS using the chi-square test, p-value and percentage method.

Keywords:

Health Department, Budget, Provincial government, Satisfaction.

Introduction

Health budget is actually the allocation of the budget to the ministries of health, its associated agencies and all those ministries, that provide health related expenditures (Helene Barroy, 2018). The public and private health expenditure forms the total health expenditure. It embodied the periodic and capital health spending from the government budgets, grants including external borrowings, donations from the non-governmental organizations, international agencies and the compulsory social insurance funds. The government spends on the health sector in order to improve the health structure and program, prolong and improve quality of life and provide prevention from diseases. Health expenditure encapsulate the provision of the health services,

¹ Lecturer Pakistan Studies in NUML Peshawar Campus Email: muhammad.ibrahim@numl.edu.pk (Corresponding Author)

² PhD scholar Department of history & Pakistan Studies, International Islamic University Islamabad

³ MPhil Scholar, Islamia College Peshawar

preventive and medicinal, family planning, nutrition and emerging aid distinguished for health. (Sengupta, 2016).

Likewise, in health sector there is financial accountability comprising of budgeting, audit and accounting systems that attempt to ensure appropriate use of the resources on the agreed upon purposes in order to reduce corrupt practices (Bossert, February 2008). The allocation of the available resources and meeting of the increasing costs are the important factor of the health sector reforms. The generation of the resources is a critical component of implementation process. The challenges for most of the governments is facilitation of the poor by concentrating the resources on compensating the market failures and efficiently financing services (Blas, 2005).

In case of Pakistan, health care is provided through a mixed system breached into public and private. The budget allocation was administered by the federal government that is decentralized after the passage of 18th constitutional amendment in the 1973 Constitution of the Islamic Republic of Pakistan. The health sector after decentralization is legally and administratively accomplished by the provincial and local governments (Faraz Salahuddin, 2021). The provincial government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa during its rule (2013-18) initiated the universal health care initiative in which it introduced *Sehat Sahulat* program. It is actually a government run health protection initiative that provides significant financial coverage to the secondary and tertiary treatment facilities in the province to the below poverty line segments (Hussain, 2019).

The government of PTI prioritised the health department and initiated universal health care initiative by introducing *Sehat Sahulat* program, allocated budget for the provision of free treatment to the cancer patients, ensured the availability of the insulin and necessary medicine for the diabetic patients and those suffering with kidney diseases (Reporter, 2018). The current study revealed that public is satisfied to a greater extent (37.39%)⁴ with the performance of the provincial government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (2013-18) for allocating a satisfactory budget to the health sector for improving the health status of the citizens in the province.

⁴ This is the average percentage that has been calculated by taking the average percentage of the percentages of all those questions which have been asked from the respondents in determining the public perception regarding the allocated budget to the health sector by the provincial government of KP (2013-18).

METHODOLOGY:

This paper is based on quantitative and analytical methods in which primary data is collected from the public and experts of the health department and were inquired through questionnaire. The experts comprise of doctors, paramedics serving in the health care centres.

OPERATIONALISATION OF THE VARIABLES:

In the current study, the term health department means the operational health care centres in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa. Similarly, budget means the allocated and assigned budget to the provincial health department by the provincial government in its tenure (2013-18). However, the public satisfaction is used for measuring the performance of the government, where greater extent satisfaction means performed well, average extent satisfaction means the average performance while the lower extent portrays the poor performance of the provincial government.

SAMPLING METHOD AND SIZE:

The universe of the study is district Charsadda and Peshawar in which one rural and one urban tehsils from Charsadda and likewise towns in Peshawar are considered. For conducting this survey, a simple random sampling technique is used. Yamane formula is used for selecting the number of respondents. The total number of respondents were 400 from the public and 64 experts were interviewed through the questionnaire.

Q 1. TO WHICH EXTENT ARE YOU SATISFIED WITH THE HEALTH BUDGET IN KP (2013-18)?

Table II

Variables	Sub-Category	Greater Extent	Average Extent	Lower Extent	Total	Chi-Square Value	P- Value
Gender	Male	91 27.0%	148 43.9%	98 29.1%	337 100.0%	21.077	0.000
	Female	43 46.2%	42 45.2%	8 8.6%	93 100.0%		
	Total	134 31.2%	190 44.2%	106 24.7%	430 100.0%		
	18-30	44	41	25	110	14.196	0.007

Age		40.0%	37.3%	22.7%	100.0%		
	31-40	34	86	43	163		
		20.9%	52.8%	26.4%	100.0%		
	41 and Above	56	63	38	157		
		35.7%	40.1%	24.2%	100.0%		
Total	134	190	106	430			
	31.2%	44.2%	24.7%	100.0%			
Education	Illiterate	33	41	26	100	5.691	0.682
		33.0%	41.0%	26.0%	100.0%		
	Matriculate	18	22	18	58		
		31.0%	37.9%	31.0%	100.0%		
	Intermediate	36	43	26	105		
		34.3%	41.0%	24.8%	100.0%		
Graduate	33	55	22	110			
	30.0%	50.0%	20.0%	100.0%			
Postgraduate	14	29	14	57			
	24.6%	50.9%	24.6%	100.0%			
Total	134	190	106	430			
	31.2%	44.2%	24.7%	100.0%			
Profession	Government Servant	28	22	4	54		
		51.9%	40.7%	7.4%	100.0%		
	Private Service Sector	22	34	23	79		
		27.8%	43.0%	29.1%	100.0%		

	Businessmen & Shopkeepers	36 39.6%	37 40.7%	18 19.8%	91 100.0%	32.553	0.000
	Health Experts	10 47.6%	7 33.3%	4 19.0%	21 100.0%		
	Education Experts	7 25.9%	14 51.9%	6 22.2%	27 100.0%		
	Others	31 19.6%	76 48.1%	51 32.3%	158 100.0%		
	Total	134 31.2%	190 44.2%	106 24.7%	430 100.0%		
Monthly Income	PKR 21000 and Below	58 39.5%	62 42.2%	27 18.4%	147 100.0%	10.189	0.037
	PKR 22000 and Above	48 28.6%	71 42.3%	49 29.2%	168 100.0%		
	Sorry	28 24.3%	57 49.6%	30 26.1%	115 100.0%		
	Total	134 31.2%	190 44.2%	106 24.7%	430 100.0%		
Area	Rural	90 31.4%	120 41.8%	77 26.8%	287 100.0%	2.772	0.250
	Urban	44 30.8%	70 49.0%	29 20.3%	143 100.0%		
	Total	134 31.2%	190 44.2%	106 24.7%	430 100.0%		

EXPLANATION:

A good number of the female respondents (46.2%) seconded by the government servants by profession (51.9%) responded with a greater extent satisfaction from the allocated budget. It further signifies that the respondents of the middle age group (52.8%), the postgraduate respondents (50.9%), the education experts by profession (51.9%), the ‘Sorry’ group of income (49.6%) and the urban respondents (49.0%) were pleased to an average with the apportioned budget to the health sector. The chi-square test furnished significant p-values for the variables of the gender, age, profession and monthly income consideration. Likewise, the education and area consideration were conveyed as an insignificant with its p-values > 0.05. The significant variables were closely associated with the allocated budget while there is no association between the insignificant variables and the public satisfaction with the allocated budget to the health care system.

It also digs out that the government servants by profession were satisfied with the performance of the provincial government of KP in its rule (2013-18) that for allocating beneficial budget to the health sector.

Q 2. TO WHICH EXTENT ARE YOU SATISFIED WITH THE SALARY INCREASE OF MEDICAL STAFF IN KP (2013-18)?

Table 12

Variables	Sub-Category	Greater Extent	Average Extent	Lower Extent	Total	Chi-Square Value	P- Value
Gender	Male	152 45.1%	113 33.5%	72 21.4%	337 100.0%	5.594	0.061
	Female	30 32.3%	35 37.6%	28 30.1%	93 100.0%		
	Total	182 42.3%	148 34.4%	100 23.3%	430 100.0%		
Age	18-30	60 54.5%	32 29.1%	18 16.4%	110 100.0%	12.674	0.013
	31-40	69 42.3%	58 35.6%	36 22.1%	163 100.0%		

	41 and Above	53 33.8%	58 36.9%	46 29.3%	157 100.0%		
	Total	182 42.3%	148 34.4%	100 23.3%	430 100.0%		
Education	Illiterate	31 31.0%	33 33.0%	36 36.0%	100 100.0%	19.873	0.011
	Matriculate	28 48.3%	21 36.2%	9 15.5%	58 100.0%		
	Intermediate	41 39.0%	36 34.3%	28 26.7%	105 100.0%		
	Graduate	52 47.3%	37 33.6%	21 19.1%	110 100.0%		
	Postgraduate	30 52.6%	21 36.8%	6 10.5%	57 100.0%		
	Total	182 42.3%	148 34.4%	100 23.3%	430 100.0%		
Profession	Government Servant	25 46.3%	18 33.3%	11 20.4%	54 100.0%	18.729	0.044
	Private Service Sector	35 44.3%	29 36.7%	15 19.0%	79 100.0%		
	Businessmen & Shopkeepers	38 41.8%	24 26.4%	29 31.9%	91 100.0%		
	Health Experts	11 52.4%	7 33.3%	3 14.3%	21 100.0%		
	Education Experts	18 66.7%	4 14.8%	5 18.5%	27 100.0%		

					%		
	Others	55	66	37	158		
		34.8%	41.8%	23.4%	100.0%		
	Total	182	148	100	430		
		42.3%	34.4%	23.3%	100.0%		
Monthly Income	PKR 21000 and Below	64	48	35	147	9.071	0.059
		43.5%	32.7%	23.8%	100.0%		
	PKR 22000 and Above	67	70	31	168		
		39.9%	41.7%	18.5%	100.0%		
Sorry		51	30	34	115		
		44.3%	26.1%	29.6%	100.0%		
	Total	182	148	100	430		
		42.3%	34.4%	23.3%	100.0%		
Area	Rural	119	99	69	287	0.382	0.826
		41.5%	34.5%	24.0%	100.0%		
	Urban	63	49	31	143		
		44.1%	34.3%	21.7%	100.0%		
	Total	182	148	100	430		
		42.3%	34.4%	23.3%	100.0%		

EXPLANATION:

A significant number of the postgraduate respondents (52.6%), the male respondents (45.1%), the respondents having age group of 18-30 (54.5%), the education experts by profession (66.7%), the undisclosed group of the monthly income (44.3%) and the urban respondents (44.1%) responded in favour of the salary increase of health staff in order to concentrate on serving the public. Significant p-values were delivered with the application of the chi-square test in favour

of the age, education, profession and the monthly income consideration. An insignificant p-value is declared for the variables of gender and area. The significant resulted variables had p-value < 0.05 unveiled close attachment with the increased salaries of the staff in health department while the insignificant variables show disunity between the gender, area and the increment noticed in the salaries of the staff providing services in the health department.

It further solidified that the education experts by profession affirmed the Khyber Pakhtunkhwa government for its satisfactory performance for allocating sufficient budget to health department in terms of the increment made in the salaries of the staff serving the health care centres.

Q 3. TO WHICH EXTENT ARE YOU SATISFIED WITH THE FACILITIES PROVIDED TO MEDICAL STAFF IN KP (2013-18)?

Table 13

Variables	Sub-Category	Greater Extent	Average Extent	Lower Extent	Total	Chi-Square Value	P-Value
Gender	Male	166 49.3%	97 28.8%	74 22.0%	337 100.0%	7.571	0.023
	Female	32 34.4%	39 41.9%	22 23.7%	93 100.0%		
	Total	198 46.0%	136 31.6%	96 22.3%	430 100.0%		
Age	18-30	50 45.5%	31 28.2%	29 26.4%	110 100.0%	1.702	0.790
	31-40	75 46.0%	53 32.5%	35 21.5%	163 100.0%		
	41 and Above	73 46.5%	52 33.1%	32 20.4%	157 100.0%		
	Total	198 46.0%	136 31.6%	96 22.3%	430 100.0%		

					%		
Education	Illiterate	44	26	30	100	11.128	0.195
		44.0%	26.0%	30.0%	100.0%		
	Matriculate	32	14	12	58		
		55.2%	24.1%	20.7%	100.0%		
	Intermediate	42	43	20	105		
		40.0%	41.0%	19.0%	100.0%		
Profession	Graduate	55	34	21	110	19.570	0.034
		50.0%	30.9%	19.1%	100.0%		
	Postgraduate	25	19	13	57		
		43.9%	33.3%	22.8%	100.0%		
	Total	198	136	96	430		
		46.0%	31.6%	22.3%	100.0%		
Profession	Government Servant	18	24	12	54	19.570	0.034
		33.3%	44.4%	22.2%	100.0%		
	Private Service Sector	40	23	16	79		
		50.6%	29.1%	20.3%	100.0%		
	Businessmen & Shopkeepers	34	32	25	91		
		37.4%	35.2%	27.5%	100.0%		
Profession	Health Experts	6	10	5	21	19.570	0.034
		28.6%	47.6%	23.8%	100.0%		
	Education Experts	12	6	9	27		
		44.4%	22.2%	33.3%	100.0%		
	Others	88	41	29	158		
	55.7%	25.9%	18.4%	100.0%			

	Total	198	136	96	430		
		46.0%	31.6%	22.3%	100.0%		
Monthly Income	PKR 21000 and Below	55	56	36	147	9.867	0.043
		37.4%	38.1%	24.5%	100.0%		
	PKR 22000 and Above	78	51	39	168		
		46.4%	30.4%	23.2%	100.0%		
Area	Sorry	65	29	21	115		
		56.5%	25.2%	18.3%	100.0%		
	Total	198	136	96	430		
		46.0%	31.6%	22.3%	100.0%		
Area	Rural	116	99	72	287	11.128	0.004
		40.4%	34.5%	25.1%	100.0%		
	Urban	82	37	24	143		
		57.3%	25.9%	16.8%	100.0%		
	Total	198	136	96	430		
		46.0%	31.6%	22.3%	100.0%		

EXPLANATION:

A prominent number of the male respondents (49.3%), respondents of the age group of 41 and above (46.5%), the matriculate respondents (55.2%), the 'Others' group of profession (55.7%), the 'Sorry' group of income (56.5%) and the urban respondents (57.3%) responded in favour of the introduced facilities to the medical staff in the health sector. The 'Others' group of professionals included the farmers, unemployed, retired persons, skilled, unskilled labourers and the students. The chi-square test shows significant p-values for the gender, profession, monthly income and the area consideration. The variables having p-values < 0.05 showed link between the significant variables and the increased facilities for the medical staff in the health curing

centres. It also showed insignificant results for the age and education that separated the insignificant variables and the introduced facilitations for the medical staff.

The provided details proceeded that the urban respondents were curious about notifying the ensured facilitations for the medical staff in the health curing centres and advanced towards the good performance of the provincial government of KP.

Q 4. TO WHICH EXTENT ARE YOU SATISFIED WITH THE FACILITIES PROVIDED TO PATIENTS IN KP (2013-18)?

Table 14

Variables	Sub-Category	Greater Extent	Average Extent	Lower Extent	Total	Chi-Square Value	P-Value
Gender	Male	109 32.3%	87 25.8%	141 41.8%	337 100.0%	0.458	0.795
	Female	30 32.3%	27 29.0%	36 38.7%	93 100.0%		
	Total	139 32.3%	114 26.5%	177 41.2%	430 100.0%		
Age	18-30	34 30.9%	28 25.5%	48 43.6%	110 100.0%	1.104	0.894
	31-40	56 34.4%	45 27.6%	62 38.0%	163 100.0%		
	41 and Above	49 31.2%	41 26.1%	67 42.7%	157 100.0%		
	Total	139 32.3%	114 26.5%	177 41.2%	430 100.0%		
Education	Illiterate	33 33.0%	24 24.0%	43 43.0%	100 100.0%	11.640	0.168
	Matriculate	18	10	30	58		

		31.0%	17.2%	51.7%	100.0%		
	Intermediate	38	22	45	105		
		36.2%	21.0%	42.9%	100.0%		
	Graduate	33	39	38	110		
		30.0%	35.5%	34.5%	100.0%		
	Postgraduate	17	19	21	57		
		29.8%	33.3%	36.8%	100.0%		
	Total	139	114	177	430		
		32.3%	26.5%	41.2%	100.0%		
Profession	Government Servant	15	21	18	54	20.830	0.022
		27.8%	38.9%	33.3%	100.0%		
	Private Service Sector	20	18	41	79		
		25.3%	22.8%	51.9%	100.0%		
	Businessmen & Shopkeepers	33	22	36	91		
		36.3%	24.2%	39.6%	100.0%		
	Health Experts	11	6	4	21		
	52.4%	28.6%	19.0%	100.0%			
	Education Experts	3	10	14	27		
		11.1%	37.0%	51.9%	100.0%		
	Others	57	37	64	158		
		36.1%	23.4%	40.5%	100.0%		
	Total	139	114	177	430		
		32.3%	26.5%	41.2%	100.0%		
Monthly	PKR 21000 and Below	62	33	52	147		

Income		42.2%	22.4%	35.4%	100.0%	10.408	0.034
	PKR 22000 and Above	43	49	76	168		
		25.6%	29.2%	45.2%	100.0%		
	Sorry	34	32	49	115		
		29.6%	27.8%	42.6%	100.0%		
	Total	139	114	177	430		
		32.3%	26.5%	41.2%	100.0%		
Area	Rural	93	89	105	287	10.983	0.004
		32.4%	31.0%	36.6%	100.0%		
	Urban	46	25	72	143		
		32.2%	17.5%	50.3%	100.0%		
	Total	139	114	177	430		
		32.3%	26.5%	41.2%	100.0%		

EXPLANATION:

An influential number of the male respondents (41.8%), the younger respondents of 18-30 age group (43.6%), the matriculate (51.7%), the respondents of the higher income group of PKR 22000 and above (45.2%) and the urban respondents (50.3%) meagrely appreciated the provision of the facilities to the patients in the health care centres. Likewise, the health experts (52.4%) supported to a greater extent the facilitation of the patients in the health care system. The chi-square test gave significant p-values for the variables of profession, monthly income and area of consideration. The significant variables were closely affiliated with the facilitation of the patients in the health sector. The insignificant p-value were declared in case of the gender, age and the educational consideration that led to the disconnection of the mentioned variables with the facilities introduced for the patients in the provincial health care centres.

The data disclosed that the matriculate respondents scarcely credited while the health experts highly credited the performance of the provincial government for the apportioned budget to the health sector in terms of the introduced convenience to the patients in the provincial health care centres.

Q 5. TO WHICH EXTENT ARE YOU SATISFIED WITH THE FACILITIES PROVIDED TO PATIENTS' ATTENDANTS IN KP (2013-18)?

Table 15

Variables	Sub-Category	Greater Extent	Average Extent	Lower Extent	Total	Chi-Square Value	P-Value
Gender	Male	109 32.3%	133 39.5%	95 28.2%	337 100.0%	5.737	0.057
	Female	19 20.4%	39 41.9%	35 37.6%	93 100.0%		
	Total	128 29.8%	172 40.0%	130 30.2%	430 100.0%		
Age	18-30	38 34.5%	30 27.3%	42 38.2%	110 100.0%	13.040	0.011
	31-40	46 28.2%	66 40.5%	51 31.3%	163 100.0%		
	41 and Above	44 28.0%	76 48.4%	37 23.6%	157 100.0%		
	Total	128 29.8%	172 40.0%	130 30.2%	430 100.0%		
Education	Illiterate	27 27.0%	37 37.0%	36 36.0%	100 100.0%	16.096	0.041
	Matriculate	11 19.0%	33 56.9%	14 24.1%	58 100.0%		
	Intermediate	30 28.6%	40 38.1%	35 33.3%	105 100.0%		

	Graduate	45 40.9%	38 34.5%	27 24.5%	110 100.0%		
	Postgraduate	15 26.3%	24 42.1%	18 31.6%	57 100.0%		
	Total	128 29.8%	172 40.0%	130 30.2%	430 100.0%		
Profession	Government Servant	5 9.3%	39 72.2%	10 18.5%	54 100.0%	56.005	0.000
	Private Service Sector	28 35.4%	28 35.4%	23 29.1%	79 100.0%		
	Businessmen & Shopkeepers	21 23.1%	34 37.4%	36 39.6%	91 100.0%		
	Health Experts	10 47.6%	10 47.6%	1 4.8%	21 100.0%		
	Education Experts	2 7.4%	9 33.3%	16 59.3%	27 100.0%		
	Others	62 39.2%	52 32.9%	44 27.8%	158 100.0%		
	Total	128 29.8%	172 40.0%	130 30.2%	430 100.0%		
Monthly Income	PKR 21000 and Below	64 43.5%	28 19.0%	55 37.4%	147 100.0%	53.603	0.000
	PKR 22000 and Above	31 18.5%	80 47.6%	57 33.9%	168 100.0%		

	Sorry	33 28.7%	64 55.7%	18 15.7%	115 100.0 %		
	Total	128 29.8%	172 40.0%	130 30.2%	430 100.0 %		
Area	Rural	90 31.4%	119 41.5%	78 27.2%	287 100.0 %	3.864	0.145
	Urban	38 26.6%	53 37.1%	52 36.4%	143 100.0 %		
	Total	128 29.8%	172 40.0%	130 30.2%	430 100.0 %		

EXPLANATION:

A large number of the female respondents (41.9%) from within the age group 41 and above (48.4%), the matriculate (56.9%), the professionals of the government servants (72.2%), the respondents of the 'Sorry' group of income (55.7%) and the rural respondents (41.5%) were satisfied to an average extent satisfaction for the introduced facilities to the attendants of the patients admitted for curing in the hospitals. The chi-square test forwarded significant p-values for the variables of the gender, age, education, profession and the monthly income and insignificant value was acquired in case of the area consideration of the respondents. The significance of the variables also amalgamated the significant variables for its p-value < 0.05 and the provision of the facilities to the attendants of the patients. An isolation is noted between the insignificant variables and the privileged patient attendants initiated by the provincial government because of its p-value > 0.05.

The provided details uncovered that the government servants by profession confessed to an average extent performance of the provincial government in terms of the provision of the facilities to the attendants of the patients in the public health care centres.

Q 6. TO WHICH EXTENT ARE YOU SATISFIED WITH THE PROVISION OF FREE MEDICINE FOR HEALTH ENHANCEMENT IN KP (2013-18)?

Table 16

Variables	Sub-Category	Greater Extent	Average Extent	Lower Extent	Total	Chi-Square Value	P- Value
Gender	Male	74 22.0%	100 29.7%	163 48.4%	337 100.0%	11.434	0.003
	Female	11 11.8%	44 47.3%	38 40.9%	93 100.0%		
	Total	85 19.8%	144 33.5%	201 46.7%	430 100.0%		
Age	18-30	17 15.5%	45 40.9%	48 43.6%	110 100.0%	9.090	0.059
	31-40	27 16.6%	56 34.4%	80 49.1%	163 100.0%		
	41 and Above	41 26.1%	43 27.4%	73 46.5%	157 100.0%		
	Total	85 19.8%	144 33.5%	201 46.7%	430 100.0%		
Education	Illiterate	21 21.0%	22 22.0%	57 57.0%	100 100.0%	11.669	0.167
	Matriculate	11 19.0%	21 36.2%	26 44.8%	58 100.0%		
	Intermediate	20 19.0%	39 37.1%	46 43.8%	105 100.0%		
	Graduate	25 22.7%	36 32.7%	49 44.5%	110 100.0%		
	Postgraduate	8	26	23	57		

		14.0%	45.6%	40.4%	100.0%		
	Total	85	144	201	430		
		19.8%	33.5%	46.7%	100.0%		
Profession	Government Servant	5	18	31	54	22.620	0.012
		9.3%	33.3%	57.4%	100.0%		
	Private Service Sector	14	28	37	79		
		17.7%	35.4%	46.8%	100.0%		
	Businessmen & Shopkeepers	16	28	47	91		
		17.6%	30.8%	51.6%	100.0%		
	Health Experts	2	8	11	21		
	9.5%	38.1%	52.4%	100.0%			
	Education Experts	2	7	18	27		
		7.4%	25.9%	66.7%	100.0%		
	Others	46	55	57	158		
		29.1%	34.8%	36.1%	100.0%		
	Total	85	144	201	430		
		19.8%	33.5%	46.7%	100.0%		
Monthly Income	PKR 21000 and Below	19	45	83	147	17.503	0.021
		12.9%	30.6%	56.5%	100.0%		
	PKR 22000 and Above	36	51	81	168		
		21.4%	30.4%	48.2%	100.0%		
	Sorry	30	48	37	115		
		26.1%	41.7%	32.2%	100.0%		
	Total	85	144	201	430		

		19.8%	33.5%	46.7%	100.0%		
Area	Rural	65	82	140	287	10.619	0.005
		22.6%	28.6%	48.8%	100.0%		
	Urban	20	62	61	143		
		14.0%	43.4%	42.7%	100.0%		
	Total	85	144	201	430		
		19.8%	33.5%	46.7%	100.0%		

EXPLANATION:

A convincing number of the rural respondents (48.8%), the illiterate respondents (57.0%), the male respondents (48.4%), the respondents from within the middle age group of 31-40 (49.1%), the education experts by profession (66.7%) and the respondents of the lower income group of PKR 21000 and below (56.5%) barely supported the provision of the free medicine for the health enhancement. The chi-square test granted significant p-values for the gender, age, profession, monthly income and the area of the respondents considered, while it gave insignificant p-values for the educational consideration. The p-values < 0.05 showed interdependence of the significant variables and the provision of the free medicine for the enhancement of the health sector while divorce occurred between the insignificant variables and the advancement of the free medicines in the provincial health care centres.

The tabulation exposed that the respondents from within the education experts accepted the performance of the government for the allocated budget in terms of the provision of the free medicine for the enhancement of the provincial health sector.

Q 7. TO WHICH EXTENT DID THE GOVERNMENT EQUALLY DISTRIBUTE FREE MEDICINE IN RURAL AND URBAN HEALTH CENTRES IN KP (2013-18)?

Table 17

Variables	Sub-Category	Greater Extent	Average Extent	Lower Extent	Total	Chi-Square Value	P-Value
Gender	Male	69	108	160	337	9.088	0.011
		20.5%	32.0%	47.5%	100.0%		

	Female	27 29.0%	38 40.9%	28 30.1%	93 100.0%		
	Total	96 22.3%	146 34.0%	188 43.7%	430 100.0%		
Age	18-30	29 26.4%	40 36.4%	41 37.3%	110 100.0%	5.264	0.261
	31-40	38 23.3%	57 35.0%	68 41.7%	163 100.0%		
	41 and Above	29 18.5%	49 31.2%	79 50.3%	157 100.0%		
	Total	96 22.3%	146 34.0%	188 43.7%	430 100.0%		
Education	Illiterate	24 24.0%	27 27.0%	49 49.0%	100 100.0%	1116.134	0.041
	Matriculate	21 36.2%	17 29.3%	20 34.5%	58 100.0%		
	Intermediate	26 24.8%	33 31.4%	46 43.8%	105 100.0%		
	Graduate	17 15.5%	44 40.0%	49 44.5%	110 100.0%		
	Postgraduate	8 14.0%	25 43.9%	24 42.1%	57 100.0%		
	Total	96 22.3%	146 34.0%	188 43.7%	430 100.0%		

Profession	Government Servant	11 20.4%	25 46.3%	18 33.3%	54 100.0%	31.796	0.000
	Private Service Sector	18 22.8%	27 34.2%	34 43.0%	79 100.0%		
	Businessmen & Shopkeepers	24 26.4%	20 22.0%	47 51.6%	91 100.0%		
	Health Experts	3 14.3%	16 76.2%	2 9.5%	21 100.0%		
	Education Experts	2 7.4%	9 33.3%	16 59.3%	27 100.0%		
	Others	38 24.1%	49 31.0%	71 44.9%	158 100.0%		
	Total	96 22.3%	146 34.0%	188 43.7%	430 100.0%		
Monthly Income	PKR 21000 and Below	30 20.4%	59 40.1%	58 39.5%	147 100.0%	15.060	0.005
	PKR 22000 and Above	30 17.9%	63 37.5%	75 44.6%	168 100.0%		
	Sorry	36 31.3%	24 20.9%	55 47.8%	115 100.0%		
	Total	96 22.3%	146 34.0%	188 43.7%	430 100.0%		
Area	Rural	57 19.9%	102 35.5%	128 44.6%	287 100.0%		

	Urban	39 27.3%	44 30.8%	60 42.0%	143 100.0%	3.141	0.208
	Total	96 22.3%	146 34.0%	188 43.7%	430 100.0%		

EXPLANATION:

A consequential number of the illiterate (49.0%), the rural (44.6%), the male respondents (47.5%) of the elderly group of 41 and above (50.3%) and the respondents of the ‘Sorry’ group of income (47.8%) readily agreed to the provincial government for the equal distribution of the free medicine in the rural and urban health care centres as per the requirement of the area. However, the health experts (76.2%) responded in reasonable pleasure with the equal medicinal provision to the rural and urban health care sectors. Significant p-values were produced by the chi-square test for the variables of the gender, education, profession and monthly income while the age and area were declared as insignificant p-valued variables. The insignificant p-valued variables showed disengagement between the age, area and the equal availability of medicines in the rural and urban health sectors. While the significance of the p-values for the variables showed unity between the gender, education, profession, monthly income and the equal distribution of the medicines in the rural and urban health care centres as per the requirements.

The above figures show that the elderly respondents were simply inclined to the performance of the provincial government of KP (2013-18) and the health experts confessed good level of satisfaction for the allotted budget to the health sector in terms of the equal distribution of the medicines in the rural and the urban health care centres as per the requirements of the localities.

Q 8. TO WHICH EXTENT WAS THE HEALTH BUDGET IN KP (2013-18) IN LINE WITH THE INTERNATIONAL STANDARD?

Table 18

Variables	Sub-Category	Greater Extent	Average Extent	Lower Extent	Total	Chi-Square Value	P-Value
Gender	Male	69 20.5%	138 40.9%	130 38.6%	337 100.0%	0.881	0.644
	Female	20	42	31	93		

		21.5%	45.2%	33.3%	100.0%		
	Total	89	180	161	430		
		20.7%	41.9%	37.4%	100.0%		
Age	18-30	26	32	52	110	13.144	0.011
		23.6%	29.1%	47.3%	100.0%		
	31-40	37	77	49	163		
		22.7%	47.2%	30.1%	100.0%		
	41 and Above	26	71	60	157		
	16.6%	45.2%	38.2%	100.0%			
	Total	89	180	161	430		
		20.7%	41.9%	37.4%	100.0%		
Education	Illiterate	17	49	34	100	12.572	0.127
		17.0%	49.0%	34.0%	100.0%		
	Matriculate	12	25	21	58		
		20.7%	43.1%	36.2%	100.0%		
	Intermediate	20	51	34	105		
		19.0%	48.6%	32.4%	100.0%		
	Graduate	30	32	48	110		
	27.3%	29.1%	43.6%	100.0%			
	Postgraduate	10	23	24	57		
		17.5%	40.4%	42.1%	100.0%		
	Total	89	180	161	430		
		20.7%	41.9%	37.4%	100.0%		
	Government Servant	8	22	24	54		

Profession		14.8%	40.7%	44.4%	100.0%	21.596	0.017
	Private Service Sector	10	39	30	79		
		12.7%	49.4%	38.0%	100.0%		
	Businessmen & Shopkeepers	27	38	26	91		
		29.7%	41.8%	28.6%	100.0%		
	Health Experts	6	8	7	21		
		28.6%	38.1%	33.3%	100.0%		
	Education Experts	3	6	18	27		
	11.1%	22.2%	66.7%	100.0%			
Others	35	67	56	158			
	22.2%	42.4%	35.4%	100.0%			
Total	89	180	161	430			
	20.7%	41.9%	37.4%	100.0%			
Monthly Income	PKR 21000 and Below	26	49	72	147	13.392	0.010
		17.7%	33.3%	49.0%	100.0%		
	PKR 22000 and Above	35	78	55	168		
		20.8%	46.4%	32.7%	100.0%		
Sorry	28	53	34	115			
	24.3%	46.1%	29.6%	100.0%			
Total	89	180	161	430			
	20.7%	41.9%	37.4%	100.0%			
Area	Rural	63	107	117	287	7.524	0.023
		22.0%	37.3%	40.8%	100.0%		
	Urban	26	73	44	143		

		18.2%	51.0%	30.8%	100.0%		
	Total	89	180	161	430		
		20.7%	41.9%	37.4%	100.0%		

EXPLANATION:

An observable number of the female respondents (45.2%), the illiterate respondents (49.0%) and the urban respondents (51.0%) were inclined towards an average extent satisfaction with the provincial government for allocating an international standard budget to the health sector. But, the younger respondents of the age group 18-30 (47.3%), the educational experts by profession (66.7%) and the respondents of the lower income group of PKR 21000 and below (49.0%) agreed to the provincial government for the apportioned budget of the health system in line with the international standards. The chi-square test issued significant p-values for the age, profession, monthly income and the area of consideration. The p-values < 0.05 indicated bondage among the age, profession, monthly income and the area to the budget aligned with the international standards. In the same way the chi-square test granted insignificant p-values for the gender and education. The p-value > 0.05 isolated the insignificant variables of gender, education and the allotted international standard budget to the health sector.

It also displayed that the urban respondents readily approved while the education experts hardly encouraged the performance of the provincial government of KP (2013-18) for the allocated budget to the health department in terms of the aligned health budget to the international standards.

Q 9. TO WHICH EXTENT DID THE HEALTH BUDGET IN KP (2013-18) ACHIEVE ITS GOALS?

Table 19

Variables	Sub-Category	Greater Extent	Average Extent	Lower Extent	Total	Chi-Square Value	P-Value
Gender	Male	90 26.7%	138 40.9%	109 32.3%	337 100.0%	4.410	0.126
	Female	19 20.4%	49 52.7%	25 26.9%	93 100.0%		

					%		
	Total	109	187	134	430		
		25.3%	43.5%	31.2%	100.0%		
Age	18-30	33	42	35	110	10.409	0.034
		30.0%	38.2%	31.8%	100.0%		
	31-40	49	72	42	163		
		30.1%	44.2%	25.8%	100.0%		
	41 and Above	27	73	57	157		
		17.2%	46.5%	36.3%	100.0%		
	Total	109	187	134	430		
		25.3%	43.5%	31.2%	100.0%		
Education	Illiterate	30	40	30	100	15.644	0.048
		30.0%	40.0%	30.0%	100.0%		
	Matriculate	16	17	25	58		
		27.6%	29.3%	43.1%	100.0%		
	Intermediate	26	46	33	105		
		24.8%	43.8%	31.4%	100.0%		
Graduate	28	48	34	110			
		25.5%	43.6%	30.9%	100.0%		
Postgraduate	9	36	12	57			
		15.8%	63.2%	21.1%	100.0%		
	Total	109	187	134	430		
		25.3%	43.5%	31.2%	100.0%		
Profession	Government Servant	30	40	30	100		
		30.0%	40.0%	30.0%	100.0%		

					%		
	Private Service Sector	16	17	25	58		
		27.6%	29.3%	43.1%	100.0		
					%		
	Businessmen & Shopkeepers	26	46	33	105		
		24.8%	43.8%	31.4%	100.0%	20.601	0.024
	Health Experts	28	48	34	110		
		25.5%	43.6%	30.9%	100.0		
					%		
	Education Experts	9	36	12	57		
		15.8%	63.2%	21.1%	100.0		
					%		
	Others	109	187	134	430		
		25.3%	43.5%	31.2%	100.0		
					%		
	Total	30	40	30	100		
		30.0%	40.0%	30.0%	100.0		
					%		
Monthly Income	PKR 21000 and Below	45	59	43	147		
		30.6%	40.1%	29.3%	100.0		
					%		
	PKR 22000 and Above	27	86	55	168		
		16.1%	51.2%	32.7%	100.0	13.686	0.008
					%		
	Sorry	37	42	36	115		
		32.2%	36.5%	31.3%	100.0		
					%		
	Total	109	187	134	430		
		25.3%	43.5%	31.2%	100.0		
					%		
Area	Rural	72	130	85	287		
		25.1%	45.3%	29.6%	100.0		
					%		
	Urban	37	57	49	143		
		25.9%	39.9%	34.3%	100.0	1.334	0.513

					%	
	Total	109	187	134	430	
		25.3%	43.5%	31.2%	100.0	
					%	

EXPLANATION:

Majority of the postgraduate respondents (63.2%) female respondents (52.7%) of the elderly group of 41 and above (46.5%) serving in the education department (63.2%) with a high income group of PKR 22000 and above (51.2%) belonging to the rural area (45.3%) were pleased to an average extent with the apportioned budget to the health system that was beneficial and remained successful in achieving its goals for improving the health system in the province. The chi-square test portrayed a significant p-value for the variables of the age, education, profession and monthly income while it gave insignificant P-values for the gender and area considerations. The p-value < 0.05 shows organization of the significant variables and the achieved goals with the apportioned budget to the health department. Similarly, the p-value > 0.05 disunited the variables of gender and area from the allocated budget that remained successful for achieving its goals in health sector.

The table displayed the performance of the provincial government that the postgraduate respondents and the educational experts by professions confessed satisfaction with the particular allotted budget in terms of the achieved goals from the allotted budget.

CONCLUSION:

The provincial government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (2013-18) after assuming power initiated improvements in the health care system. In this regard, it tried to increase the apportioned budget to the health department and ensured facilitating the patients and the staff serving in the health caring centres. It further elaborated that the allocated budget is important for exploring it in terms of the variables of the gender, age group, education, profession, monthly income and area of belongingness.

It is evident from the discussion that the male respondents are more satisfied with the performance of the provincial government of KP (2013-18) for the articulated budget to health department. In considering the age, the respondents of the older age group of 41 and above are happier with the improved budget of health caring centres. For understanding the educational qualification, the intermediate qualified respondents have credited the provincial government of

KP for introducing beneficial health budget. So far, the profession is considered the self-employed respondents of the businessmen and shopkeepers conferred greater extent satisfaction with the advanced budget of health department. Evaluating on the basis of the monthly income demonstrated that the high income respondents of 22000 and above income group are more satisfied. Similarly, the urban respondents are more inclined towards satisfaction with the performance of the provincial government of KP (2013-18) for a clear beneficent budget to the health department.

Study revealed the applicability of the public satisfaction to an average extent (37.39%) with the performance of the provincial government of KP (2013-18) about the budget assigned for the improvement of the health department in the province. The average extent satisfaction of the public portrayed average performance of the Pakistan Tehrik-e-Insaf in the province.

REFERENCE

- Blas, E. (2005). *1990 - 2000: A Decade of Health Sector Reform in Developing Countries - Why, and What Did We Learn?* Gothenburg: Nordic School of Public Health.
- Bossert, D. W. (February 2008). *Health Governance: Concepts, Experience, and Programming Options*. USA: USAID.
- Faraz Salahuddin, A. H. (2021). *Public Expenditure on Health in Pakistan: A Narrative Summary*. SA: Joint Learning Network for Universal Health Coverage, Global Financing Facility, The World Bank Group.
- Helene Barroy, E. D. (2018). *Budget Matters For Health: Key Formulation And Classification Issues*. Geneva: World Health Organization.
- Hussain, H. (2019, October 28). *Understanding Pakistan's efforts to align quality healthcare with Sustainable Development Goals*. Retrieved from South Asia @LSE: <https://blogs.lse.ac.uk/southasia/2019/10/28/understanding-pakistans-efforts-to-align-quality-healthcare-with-sustainable-development-goals/>
- Reporter. (2018, May 24). *Five-year report : Government more than doubled health budget*. Retrieved from The Express Tribune: <https://tribune.com.pk/story/1717515/five-year-report-government-doubled-health-budget>
- Sengupta, K. (2016). *Determinants of Health Status in India*. New Delhi: Springer.

