

A Look at How Pakistan Studies Textbooks, Curriculum Reform, and Teachers' Views on Global Identity Compare

Hamad Khattak

Assistant Professor at University of Punjab at-hamad4534@gmail.com

Jibran Shahid

PhD Scholar of Education at University of Punjab at- Jibran753@gamil.com

Abstract

Two primary responsibilities of educators in fostering students' global identity development are imparting knowledge about the world beyond their immediate surroundings and fostering a positive disposition towards it. Educators in traditional settings may perceive and consider the several efforts to modify the curriculum, which are linked to the idea of global identity, as a form of opposition. This study examined the viewpoints and opinions of teachers regarding the concept of global identity as it is taught in Pakistan Studies curricula and textbooks. The aim was to acquire a comprehensive picture of how changes in the curriculum are being implemented in secondary schools in Punjab, Pakistan. In order to accomplish the goals of this study, a sample of twenty-seven Pakistan Studies teachers, who were considered to be representative, were chosen to take part in semi-structured interviews. These instructors are employed by governmental or privately-funded educational institutions located inside a specific district in Punjab province, Pakistan. The data analysis revealed that the Pakistan Studies teachers' viewpoints and attitudes towards the curriculum policy exhibit a blend of opposition and dedication towards various aspects of curriculum reform pertaining to the global identity component of the policy. This was revealed when it was discovered that the Pakistan Studies instructors' opinions and attitudes towards the curriculum policy exhibit a combination of resistance and conformance.

Keywords: Gatekeeping in the curriculum, textbooks, global views, national identity, and cultural diversity

Introduction

The perspectives and ideas that teachers have have a considerable impact on the manner in which they carry out the curriculum, making them an essential component of the curriculum reform process, particularly during the phase of implementation. According to Peck and Herriot (2014), beliefs play an important part in a variety of aspects of teaching, including the comprehension of subject matter, the development of instructional plans and evaluations, as well as the dynamics of teacher-student interactions (p. 388). In addition, it has been argued that the ideologies, methodologies, and interests of educators working in the field of social studies are predominately influenced by their convictions pertaining to the three interconnected objectives of social studies instruction. These objectives are the cultivation of civic virtue, the cultivation of a sense of national identity, and the cultivation of the ability to coexist or empathize with others. It is true that the ideas and convictions of instructors with regard to various instructional strategies utilized in the subject area of Social Studies do play a role in the development of a curriculum that is utilized in the field of Pakistan Studies.

The academic discipline of Pakistan Studies incorporates several aspects of global identity with the intention of assisting students in the process of developing and establishing their own personal identities on a global scale. According to Pike (2015), the objective of the newly redesigned Pakistan Studies curriculum and the associated resources is to place a premium on the growth of students' understanding of the global landscape in the context of the effects of globalization. This was accomplished by designing the curriculum and accompanying materials with this objective in mind. This educational strategy lays a particular emphasis on teaching pupils to develop a sense of who they are in relation to the larger world (p. 11). In addition, according to Nussbaum (2002, page 4), the goal of this material is to build a sense of affinity and allegiance towards "the global community of individuals" in order to encourage a concern for the well-being of all human beings (Appiah, 2008, page 87).

The purpose of this material is to foster a sense of affinity and allegiance towards "the global community of individuals." In addition, it is important to note that Pakistan Studies is a required subject that is taught at all levels of education, beginning with secondary school and continuing through the bachelor's degree. This topic is intended to serve as a replacement for the Social Studies curriculum, which is traditionally taught during the elementary and middle school years. The study of Pakistan's geography, history, and economy is incorporated into the curriculums for both Pakistan Studies and Social Studies (Ali, 1992). According to Ahmad (2008), Social Studies and Pakistan Studies have been used for a significant amount of time as educational methods with the intention of instilling in students a feeling of patriotism, responsible citizenship, and a collective identity known as Ummah by drawing upon Islamic teachings. However, it is important to keep in mind that many of the topics dealing with global identity that are taught in the Social Studies and Pakistan Studies curricula have the potential to be viewed as problematic by teachers working in more traditional settings.

The manner in which educators understand the idea of teaching global identity has an effect on the way in which they approach the process of curriculum implementation. This is due to the fact that instructing students on material that is associated with global identity frequently necessitates the employment of instructional methodologies that are efficient in presenting a subject from a variety of perspectives. In response to a change in the curriculum for Pakistan Studies in 2006 and the subsequent release of new textbooks for Punjabi secondary schools in 2012, the purpose of this study was to investigate the thoughts and viewpoints of educators in the field of Pakistan Studies on the topic of global identity. The following is an example of a specific research issue that the current study intends to investigate: What are the thoughts of teachers of Pakistan Studies on the discourse on global identity that is provided in the redesigned textbooks that were introduced in 2012 in Punjabi secondary schools as a result of the curriculum reform that took place in 2006? It was to be anticipated that the thoughts and beliefs held by those working in the field of Pakistan Studies would be analyzed.

Framework for ideas

The incorporation of difficult themes might be seen as a method for teaching global identity. According to a number of scholars in the field of education, the cultivation of democratic engagement and the development of a well-defined national identity necessitate the inclusion of difficult topics in the curriculum (Banks et al., 2005; Camicia, 2008). Hess (2008) asserts that the inclusion of controversial subjects in educational settings facilitates the acquisition of knowledge, critical thinking, and the development of analytical skills among students. By engaging with contentious themes, students are encouraged to examine many perspectives, evaluate potential solutions, and ultimately form and defend their own positions (p. 124). Hess (2008) provides further rationales for the inclusion of contentious issues in educational settings. These include fostering an appreciation and dedication to democratic principles, stimulating interest in civic engagement, acquiring significant knowledge, promoting critical thinking abilities, and cultivating advanced interpersonal competencies (p. 124).

Nevertheless, there are educators who express dissent or resistance towards this pedagogical method in the field of social studies due to concerns that engaging in discussions on contentious subjects "may have adverse effects on certain students within their classroom" (Peck & Herriot, 2014, p. 394) or perhaps generate controversy within the broader society (Hess, 2008; Peck & Herriot, 2014). According to Muhammad and Brett (2017), it is apparent that conservative educators may perceive some global identity-related subjects addressed in Pakistan Studies courses as contentious. According to Ginsburg and Kamat (2009), the determination of the formal curriculum mostly rests with instructors, although their influence in this regard is somewhat restricted. According to Marker and Mehlinger (1996), According to Adalbjarnardottir (2002), teachers bear the responsibility of ensuring that their pupils have constructive and beneficial encounters.

According to Marker and Mehlinger (1996), social studies teachers possess significant political power since they engage in the interpretation of content within social studies curricula. The present study examines the manner in which Pakistan Studies teachers mediate textbook information by gathering instructors' expressed viewpoints and attitudes. Teachers who exercise policy discretion in their daily activities might be characterized as street-level bureaucrats, as outlined by Lipsky (2010) and Muhammad (2015), due to several contextual circumstances. The aforementioned issue is notably conspicuous in rural regions, wherein educators execute policies that are often devised at the district, provincial, or federal level prior to their dissemination to educational institutions. When such a policy is implemented to regulate the professional endeavors of educators, it grants them the power to make determinations and employ discretion in relation to those policies. They not only implement educational policy but also adhere to it.

In contrast, they have an active role in shaping education policy (Goldstein, 2008, p. 449). Furthermore, it was found through research that educators would express opposition towards a policy that aims to restrict and regulate their teaching practices by imposing curricular standards, implementing accountability systems, and

prescribing instructional methodologies (Achinstein & Ogawa, 2006, p. 31). According to a widely accepted idea, teacher opposition can be attributed to either a conservative inclination or a manifestation of personal character deficiencies. According to Achinstein and Ogawa (2006, p. 32), the term "principled resistance" refers to the deliberate actions, whether explicit or concealed, taken by educators to oppose instructional policies, programs, or any other initiatives that seek to exert control over teachers' work and undermine or contradict their professional beliefs. The ideas encompassed in this framework include the promotion of community building, the cultivation of uniqueness and creativity, and the establishment of high expectations. This serves as an additional rationale for the opposition exhibited by teachers.

It would be of academic interest to explore whether professors of Pakistan Studies self-identified as "resisters". Banks (2010) has identified many supplementary challenges that impede teachers' commitment to implementing a pluralistic curriculum. The individual held the belief that the primary barriers to establishing a curriculum that acknowledges the viewpoints of a diverse population within a society were the prioritization of high-stakes testing and accountability, the excessive dependence on textbooks for instructional purposes, and the insufficient understanding of ethnic cultural knowledge among educators. According to Muhammad and Brett (2019), Numerous educators also demonstrate political hesitancy due to their belief that adopting an inclusive stance may potentially destabilize the existing power dynamics within a heterogeneous society. Nevertheless, the individual maintains the viewpoint that ideological opposition plays a significant role in impeding the execution of this educational syllabus.

The implementation of a diverse curriculum poses challenges for educators and politicians due to the prevalence of an assimilationist ideology. According to Banks (2001), an assimilationist educator envisions a society that is perfect and lacks any form of ethnic identification. Furthermore, he posits that ethnicity serves as a catalyst for ethnic conflicts, fosters societal division, and engenders fragmentation within the social fabric. Furthermore, it prioritizes community rights over individual rights (Banks, 2001, p. [page number]). According to Banks (2001) and Spinner-Halev (2000), proponents of assimilation argue that individuals are likely to relinquish their distinct ethnic cultures in favor of a unified national culture when all ethnic groups within a nation are integrated into the national civic community.

In Pakistan, social studies educators possess a degree of autonomy and the ability to exercise independent decision-making. Limited research has been conducted in Pakistan regarding the manner in which Pakistani educators have utilized their discretion in interpreting the curricula of Social Studies and Pakistan Studies. In the context of implementing a centrally determined curriculum reform in the domain of global identity, there has been less scrutiny of the extent of individual choice. This research endeavor facilitated the exploration of the correlations between instructors' pedagogical practices and perspectives, and the adaptation of the Social Studies curriculum.

Methods

The study employed a qualitative case study design and employed deliberate selection to choose numerous cases (teachers) for interviews. The primary objective of the study was to get an understanding of the beliefs and perspectives held by teachers of Pakistan Studies, drawing on the works of Stake (1995) and Yin (2014). The researchers employed cross-case analysis as a method to gather and examine data from several cases, with the aim of producing compelling findings and interpretations (Merriam, 2009; Stake, 2013). Educators were requested to provide their insights and evaluations of the different facets of the Pakistan Studies curriculum content that was formally developed and released during the Musharraf government in 2006.

The objective was to gather their viewpoints and understandings of the global identity portrayed within the revised Pakistan Studies textbooks. Furthermore, educators were requested to furnish a compilation of the worldwide matters that they regularly instruct and deliberate upon within their educational environments. Furthermore, participants were requested to provide their insights regarding the extent of emphasis placed on global issues in the newly introduced Pakistan Studies textbooks. Furthermore, the authors were tasked with elucidating whether and how they addressed the dearth of comprehensive global ideas and concepts in the newly published textbooks on Pakistan Studies. By employing a method of inquiry involving relevant, detailed, and exploratory questioning, the researchers were able to acquire a thorough comprehension and intricate depiction of the teachers' convictions and viewpoints.

This approach also fostered an environment that encouraged the educators to expound upon their thoughts and opinions (Kvale, 1996; Legard, Keegan, & Ward, 2003). To gain a more comprehensive comprehension of the viewpoints held by teachers of Pakistan Studies regarding the content of textbooks, a cross-case analysis was performed on the interview transcripts (Miles, Huberman, & Saldaa, 2014; Saldaa, 2013). All interview transcripts were transcribed with a high degree of accuracy. Following that, a thorough examination was conducted on every interview transcript to identify instances of pre-coding. This involved the careful identification and highlighting of lines or paragraphs that were deemed to be particularly significant or notable, using techniques such as highlighting, italicizing, or coloring (Saldaa, 2013, p. 19). This facilitated the amplification of noteworthy subjects within the material that were pertinent to the study's aim.

Given the presence of numerous participants in the study, the data of the initial participant were subjected to coding prior to the analysis of the subsequent participant's data. Likewise, the data pertaining to twenty-seven persons was subjected to classification. The process of consolidating relevant codes enabled the identification of distinct subcategories within the dataset. Multiple assertions were posited through the juxtaposition and examination of diverse categories and subcategories, while the identification of select citations served to substantiate the derived results.

Conclusion

The vast majority of teachers in both public and private schools in Pakistan identified global issues as the topic that receives the least amount of attention in Pakistan Studies textbooks, which only cover a select selection of topics. This conclusion was arrived at by analyzing interview data pertaining to the topic of global identity that was covered in the textbooks. On the other hand, these educators gave off the impression that they had no issues with the material contained in the textbooks and were indifferent with the inadequate portrayal of the world outside Pakistan. Few teachers at private schools have voiced their worry about the underrepresentation of non-Muslim communities around the world, the absence of discussion of ecological concerns and global warming, and international extremism, and the lack of discussion of ecological issues and global warming.

The vast majority of teachers working in both public and private schools in Pakistan have advocated for national issues to be prioritized over international and regional concerns in any future curriculums or textbooks pertaining to Pakistan Studies. It's interesting to note that just two of the professors underlined how important it is to have a global identity. One teacher at a prominent private school emphasized the need of building a closer link with humanity as opposed to the Pakistani people. This was done since nationalism encourages enmity by dividing humanity into states and fostering competition between nations. The second teacher, who was employed in a public school, highlighted the need of instilling in students a sense of belonging to the Muslim Ummah. Through the use of professional development courses, teachers need to be made aware of the issues that are involved with the teaching of topics such as national identity, ethnic and religious diversity, and global viewpoints.

The theoretical intricacies that are covered in the curriculum should not be the exclusive focus of pre-service and in-service training for instructors; they need also be exposed to the practical foundations of these concepts. Les instructors were less interested with integrating the students into the larger international community and more concerned on cultivating the students' sense of belonging to the Pakistani nation. In addition, Joshi (2010) makes the case that the emphasis that is placed on the Muslim Ummah in school textbooks is "research to develop a 'regionality' separate from India's acquisition of the grand narrative of the subcontinent's natural geographical unity" (Joshi, 2010, p.). Joshi's argument can be found on page 20 of his book. Teaching pupil's discourses that are nationalistic, exclusionary, and religiously motivated can have a harmful influence on world peace, according to Lall (2008).

This is especially true when Pakistani and Indian children are taught competing histories on each side of the border. Given that "nationalism and national identity cannot exist independently without relating to other cultures, peoples, and lands," achieving this goal in this day and age of increased globalization is an exceptionally difficult endeavor. As a reaction to the "globalizing world," imaginative solutions are required, and school curriculum must strike a balance between enabling students to keep their different local identities and training them to be cohesive members of the global community (Dattoo, 2009, p. 220). This is a challenge that must be met in order to effectively address the "globalizing world." However, this does not

imply that students' national and cultural identities ought to be prioritized above their global identities in any way.

REFERENCES

- Achinstein, B., & Ogawa, R. T. (2006). (In) Fidelity: What the resistance of new teachers reveals about professional principles and prescriptive educational policies. *Harvard Educational Review*, 76(1), 30-63.
- Adalbjarnardottir, S. (2002). Citizenship education and teachers' professional awareness. In D. Scott & H. Lawson (Eds.), *Citizenship education and the curriculum* (pp. 131-149). Westport, Conn.: Ablex Pub.
- Ahmad, I. (2008). The anatomy of an Islamic model: Citizenship education in Pakistan. In D. Grossman, W. O. Lee, & K. Kennedy (Eds.), *Citizenship Curriculum in Asia and the Pacific* (pp. 97-109). Netherlands: Springer.
- Ali, M. (1992). Akbar in Pakistani textbooks. *Social Scientist*, 20(9/10), 73-76.
- Appiah, K. A. (2008). Education for global citizenship. *Yearbook of the National Society for the Study of Education*, 107(1), 83-99.
- Banks, J. A. (2001). Citizenship education and diversity. *Journal of Teacher Education*, 52(1), 5-16.
- Banks, J. A. (2010). Approaches to multicultural curriculum reform. In J. A. Banks & C. A. M. Banks (Eds.), *Multicultural education: Issues and perspectives* (pp. 233-256). Hoboken, New Jersey: John Wiley & Sons, Inc.
- Banks, J. A., Banks, C. M., Cortés, C., Hahn, C., Merryfield, M., Moodley, K., . . . Parker, W. (2005). *Democracy and diversity: Principles and concepts for educating citizens in a global age*. Retrieved from <http://depts.washington.edu/centerme/DemDiv.pdf>
- Camicia, S. P. (2008). Deciding what is a controversial issue: A case study of social studies curriculum controversy. *Theory & Research in Social Education*, 36(4), 298-316.
- Datoo, A.-K. (2009). *Critical ethnography, local-global cultural dynamics and students' identity: Perspectives from an urban school in Pakistan*. (Unpublished doctoral dissertation), McGill University, Montreal.
- Ginsburg, M. B., & Kamat, S. G. (2009). The political orientations of teachers. In L. J. Saha & A. G. Dworkin (Eds.), *International Handbook of Research on Teachers and Teaching* (pp. 231-241). New York: Springer.
- Goldstein, L. S. (2008). Kindergarten teachers making "street-level" education policy in the wake of No Child Left Behind. *Early Education and Development*, 19(3), 448-478.
- Hess, D. (2008). Controversial issues and democratic discourse. In L. S. Levstik & C. A. Tyson (Eds.), *Handbook of research in social studies education* (pp. 124-136). New York: Taylor & Francis.
- Joshi, S. (2010). Contesting histories and nationalist geographies: a comparison of school textbooks in India and Pakistan. *South Asian History and Culture*, 1(3), 357-377. doi:10.1080/19472498.2010.485379
- Kvale, S. (1996). *InterViews: An introduction to qualitative research writing*. Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications.

- Lall, M. (2008). Educate to hate: The use of education in the creation of antagonistic national identities in India and Pakistan. *Compare*, 38(1), 103-119.
- Legard, R., Keegan, J., & Ward, K. (2003). In-depth interviews. In J. Ritchie & J. Lewis (Eds.), *Qualitative research practice: A guide for social science students and researchers* (pp. 138-169). London: Sage Publications Ltd.
- Lipsky, M. (2010). *Street-level bureaucracy: Dilemmas of the individual in public service* (30th Ann. ed.). New York: Russell Sage Foundation.
- Marker, G., & Mehlinger, H. (1996). Social studies. In P. W. Jackson (Ed.), *Handbook of research on curriculum: A project of the American Educational Research Association* (pp. 830-851). USA: Simon & Schuster Macmillan.
- Merriam, S. B. (2009). *Qualitative Research: A guide to design and implementation*. San Francisco: John Wiley & Sons.