

## **There are Few Locations Suitable for an Ethnography of a Fictitious Group.**

**Ihsan Ahmad**

Professor at university of Sindh at [ahmad853@gmail.com](mailto:ahmad853@gmail.com)

**Mehran Jutt**

PhD scholar at University of Sindh at [Mehran@gmail.com](mailto:Mehran@gmail.com)

### **Abstract**

This article critically examines some of the most prominent analytical principles in the field of anthropology of migration. The author does this by conducting an ethnographic study among Lebanese migrants now residing in multiple countries. Subsequently, this investigation delves into the concept of multi-sited ethnography and determines that the notion of a separate, physically disconnected site is more beneficial than multi-sited ethnography for studying migrants who share a common culture across several global places. This essay offers its findings and conclusions, as well as analyzing the prevalent usage of the phrase "imagined community" in the field of diasporic studies. According to a prevalent notion, written artistic works that utilize the term "community" frequently lack sufficient empirical data to substantiate the assertion that such a "community" actually exists. The article's last section provides a critical analysis of the commonly accepted belief that the terms "migration" and "mobility" are essentially the same. Contrary to the implied meaning of "mobility," the argument suggests that migrants do not spend a substantial amount of time physically relocating.

**Keywords:** Migration, mobility, multi-sited ethnography, and the transnational society of Lebanese people

### **INTRODUCTION**

I have recently begun writing a book, which will draw heavily from the findings of an intensive ethnographic study of the Lebanese diaspora that I conducted over the course of four years. As is common in situations of this nature, I used a more methodical strategy while pondering the theoretical and methodological issues that came throughout the course of my research. This was due to the fact that I had only a cursory understanding of the specific field of research that I was investigating. During the course of my examination into the most recent theoretical and ethnographic literature in the subject, I came across several fresh concepts. This is an experience that a great number of researchers who are engaged in investigations that are analogous to mine have had. I intend to investigate some of the ideas that are discussed in this article, specifically those that helped me get started on my project at the beginning but became less useful as I progressed in my investigation, which led to a reduced capacity to explain both my research strategy and the empirical phenomena that are being investigated. The fundamental purpose of this research was to investigate the phenomena of migration that originated from two unique mountain villages in

Lebanon, one of which was situated in the mountainous northern portion of the nation, and the other of which was located in the mountainous central region of the country. All of the previously named communities adhere to the Maronite Catholic faith. When compared to Village C, which is located in the center region, Village N, which is found in the northern region, demonstrates a degree of development that is substantially lower. Despite the fact that a sizeable amount of Village N's population is employed away from the community in a wide variety of professions, ranging from manual labor to business ownership, agricultural pursuits continue to exert a preponderant influence over the community's economic landscape. In comparison to village C, village A demonstrates a lower degree of integration within the Lebanese capitalist cycle. This cycle is predominantly driven by the banking sector, as well as service industries and tourism. The latter can be found directly beneath and in close proximity to a ski resort. As a consequence of this, the region has continually drawn a demographic that is comprised of Lebanese skiers from the middle-class and affluent strata, which has consequently fostered the creation of a specialized economy catering to the requirements of these skiers. The possibility of observing lifestyles typical of those in the middle class was the primary element that drew me to the second village. It is something that has piqued my curiosity to learn more about how people's aspirations and migration patterns are affected by the geographical and socioeconomic context in which they were raised. A net outflow of migrants may be seen in these areas, just as it can be seen in every other part of Lebanon. People who descended from the northern colony can be found in large numbers in a variety of places, including Boston and Texas in the United States, Sydney and Melbourne in Australia, Barquisimeto and Caracas in Venezuela, and others. It is important to note that a somewhat lower percentage of this population can also be located in the city of So Paulo. People from many different parts of the world have come to live in the large settlement, which includes people from places like the Arabian Gulf, Philadelphia, Vermont, Gatineau in Canada, Paris, and London. I carried out an investigation in Lebanon throughout the first year of the study, during which time I lived in two different villages for a period of several months each. The gathering of information concerning the cultural and socioeconomic aspects of these communities was the major purpose of this study. In addition, a substantial amount of emphasis was focused on investigating the movement patterns of the native population as well as the ways in which newcomers integrated themselves into the day-to-day activities of the local villages. During the course of my contacts with

villagers, I was given the chance to participate in conversations about their immigrant relatives and their individual goals and objectives. During the course of these conversations, I happened to overhear the locals debating the benefits and cons of their future or previous experiences with migration, and I found it quite interesting. After that, I got started on my very first global expedition, and I planned to spend approximately seven days in each of the key global locations that had a significant number of people living there. During the course of my research in the rural areas of Lebanon, I became quite close with the families of a number of people, and the social networks that I developed in each of these locations were comprised of their families. I chose one large family to represent each community after taking into account their participation in a number of the area's global centers of movement. In addition, I determined whether or not they were ready and able to accept me as a member of their family by engaging in in-depth conversation with them and researching a wide range of potential alternatives. My research activities throughout the primary time that spanned from the middle of the year 2000 to the middle of the year 2004 primarily concerned flight travel between Lebanon, Barquisimeto, Boston, and Melbourne in regard to the family that resided in the northern village. In a similar vein, flights were booked between Lebanon, London, Paris, and Philadelphia with the goal of researching the family who lived in the central village. During my time spent in each of these previously mentioned locations, I had the chance to spend a period of one week or more, and on a few cases, an entire month, living with a host family who was a member of the community in which I was stationed. The dwelling that is the subject of this investigation served as the primary location at which I carried out my ethnographic research.

#### NOTES ON MANY-SITED ETHNOGRAPHS

We have transitioned from return and yo-yo migration to multi-location zigzag migration. We need a new method of tracking the movement of individuals. Consequently, multi-site ethnography is required. In a society that is increasingly globalized and networked, where culture has been "de-territorialized" and fluxes are the norm, an ethnographic approach of this nature is crucial. Roger Rouse's 1991 study on Mexican immigration in the United States is regarded as a precursor to George

Marcus's volumes on multisitedness. Since I have spent the last four years traveling to eight different countries, the reader may conclude that I enjoy multi-site ethnography. In fact, I am not. Initially, I viewed my investigation as a multi-site ethnography. Sincerely, I do not believe the concept is viable. It makes no difference whether you concur or disagree. I do not believe that multi-sited ethnographies are possible. My first travels around the world, during which I moved from location to location and stayed with the families I was working with, went well, and I would have felt comfortable conducting a multi-sited ethnography if it weren't for a minor obstacle. I always experienced jet fatigue. Multi-site ethnography was detrimental, particularly for individuals with families and classes to return to who were unable to remain. They must arrive at all destinations on schedule. The bodies of postmodern anthropologists are not designed for such rapid and strenuous travel over extended distances. When I realized that no writer of migration and multi-sited ethnography had mentioned jet lag, I chuckled. How they conducted this multi-site ethnographic investigation on their own intrigues me. Possibly a younger individual without a family to hurry to or unequal childrearing labor to negotiate with their partner could have physically handled this situation. Despite this, I believe a larger issue rendered multi-site ethnography infeasible. During my initial global travels, it was simple for me to stop in France, visit family, depart for London, meet the other side of the family, depart for Boston, etc. Arrival and departure become more challenging as time passes. People's problems, my relationship with them, their expectations of me, my expectations of them, my inquiries, and the social relationships I was learning about made it difficult for me to enter and exit the cultures I was studying. They stated that it became denser. It became increasingly difficult to leap about. Thick ethnography is determined by immersion, not choice. Immersion in particular social relationships compels one to either become an ardent ethnographer or none at all. There is no ethnography, only a complex relationship with the field. As my involvement increased, I became more susceptible to the gravitational pulls that draw individuals into social fields and make it difficult to leave (Bourdieu, 1993). Y and Z are seated as I conduct an interview with X. I am aware that Z is troubled by X's remark. Z has strong feelings about it. As a result, interview-induced emotions and mental processing are more complicated. Now, every field visit and departure was a momentous occasion, and the time between them was less touristic and more social, psychological, and analytical, as well as taxing. We knew that completing one website would be challenging. How are so many websites

analyzed so thoroughly? After making a decision, I had a greater understanding of the issue. I could not actively partake in more than two locations. If I wished to examine transnational families and communities worldwide, I could not regard each location as a separate site. Are these dispersed sites truly a multi-sited ethnography if I regard the entire family with all of its global locations as a single site? This may be true, but it would be detrimental to an anthropological site. If we assume that the site is too difficult to master, then I was not researching a multi-sited world. My research centered on the location of the international family. Despite being dispersed, the site was unique. Physical exertion was still required to study such a vast area, but I now had a distinct study objective. In a broader sense, it is physically impossible to conduct a multi-sited ethnography of the web of social connections in which X is rooted in A, B, C, and D when studying a culture whose members are located in geographically distinct sites. Nevertheless, we can ethnograph the interactions between subcultural groups "X1" at site A, "X2" at site B, "X3" at site C, and "X4" at site D. Therefore, the location E where X1, X2, X3, and X4 interact socially is unique. Our knowledge of X1 as based on A, X2 as based on B, etc., must suffer as a result. In lieu of an either/or dilemma, the emphasis is placed on what is realistic and considerate. No ethnography can fully capture all social ties, but it may be useful to ruminate on the social ties one chooses not to study in order to better define the scope of one's research. Frequently, anthropologists admit to evaluating realities as bounded without taking mobility and fluidity into account, investigating X1's relationship to A but not X2's. Yes, but I assume what I'm trying to say is that this criticism is impractical. Neither early anthropologists nor ourselves were capable of acting differently. Gulick, an early anthropologist of the Lebanese village, observed that a significant portion of the communities' land is owned by foreigners, but he nevertheless analyzed "the Lebanese village" as a circumscribed entity (Gulick, 1953). I chose to ethnograph the relationship between X1, X2, X3, and X4 in my investigation, rather than X1 versus A, B, etc. I viewed my location as the non-contiguous territory that supported a transnational familial culture with strong social ties. You highlight international relations and the flow of products, information, capital, people, and emotions within them by doing so. Even if the two cannot be understood independently, it is a decision to prioritize the transnational culture of the migrants over their settlement culture. When conceptualized as I have done here, transnational research supports an additional claim made by multi-sited ethnographers. Multi-sited ethnography challenges the conventional notion that the

ethnographer and the subjects remain in a single location. Throughout my investigation, I believed I was creative, and seminar attendees concurred. As I viewed a map I had created depicting the global flow of communication between family homes, another map depicting communication across spatially noncontiguous areas appeared. The Kula ring chart. It was an intriguing "discovery": do they ever consider the Kula, these global and multi-sited anthropological innovators who endeavor to be "ever so original" by demonstrating how constrained the discipline's ancestors were? Malinowski was not a "multisited" ethnographer with the Kula, if multisitedness only implies circulation across physically non-contiguous places. Had he not examined movement as ethnography as opposed to inactivity? Elders in a field frequently do more to appear avant-garde than "innovators" give them credit for. Recent observations by Ira Bashkow have demonstrated that flow is already incorporated into Boasian anthropology's fundamental concept of "diffusion" (Bashkow, 2004), which anthropologists who interpret it as an invention based on an immutable definition of culture overlook. My research could be referred to as "neo-Kulan ethnography." My concept emphasizes the need for foundations for migrants and challenges the rhizomatic, perpetually on a "route" to nowhere approach to the diasporic state; hence, this expression is appropriate.

## TRANSNATIONAL COMMUNITIES

During the initial stages of my research, I found the word "transnational communities" to be beneficial. However, as my investigation into the cultural aspects of transnational families advanced, I started to question its conceptual clarity. The aforementioned notion is garnering considerable attention within the realm of diaspora studies. It is evident that each diaspora constitutes a distinct group, irrespective of individual sentiments towards it. The application of this concept has been observed in several contexts, including the research conducted by multiple anthropologists within my profession that investigate Lebanese communities that are distributed worldwide. Additionally, this concept has been employed in scenarios where it further develops the notion of the "global village" (Nabti, 1992). Upon commencing the process of spatially discerning the migrants originating from the various villages under investigation, it became evident that a notable absence of a robust transnational community existed among them, hence eliciting a sense of astonishment.

Notwithstanding the geographical dispersion of its members, the villagers undeniably experienced a collective feeling of community. In the majority of instances, it was often a tenuous claim to argue that the villagers formed a worldwide community and possessed a collective feeling of affiliation with a transnational peasant community. Consequently, I redirected my focus towards scholarly investigations pertaining to international communities. What evidence was offered to support the assertion that individuals who departed from a particular village and resettled in a different location subsequently established a cohesive community? I must acknowledge that my knowledge on this subject is quite limited. The recent cautionary statements made by Ralph Grillo (2001) and Stephen Castles (2002) regarding the inaccurate utilization of this concept have supplied me with a sense of reassurance. The sole criteria for categorizing specific individuals as members of a transnational society seems to be their shared beginnings (such as originating from the same city or country) and their widespread dispersion around the globe. Furthermore, the researchers who were concerned did not seem to be alarmed by the absence of actual evidence regarding connection. The establishment of explicit and enduring social connections among individuals does not seem to be a prerequisite for categorizing them as a community. What is the underlying cause or explanation? The villagers seem to have established a "imagined community," a concept that is currently being discussed in academic discourse. The remarkable prevalence of the concept of "imagined community" within the field of "diasporic studies" is truly remarkable. The intention of this statement is to acknowledge that Anderson's (1983) use of the concept is not intended to be diminished in terms of its originality. It seems that this rationale is currently being employed as a justification for abstaining from conducting a substantive inquiry aimed at substantiating the collective identity of a group of individuals as a community. When an individual delivering a paper on a diasporic community is questioned about the substantiation of the community aspect within the diasporic group under investigation, they respond with a perplexed expression and assert that the community they are examining is a "imagined community," so suggesting that conventional criteria for community identification are not applicable in this context. In this particular case, it is evident that the concept of the "imagined community" mostly encompasses the researcher's imaginative construct rather than a substantial community. I am delighted to inform the readers that the extended transnational families that I examined were not easily conceptualized. These are familial groupings

characterized by well-defined and measurable social interactions. Given that every member of the family possessed tangible awareness of one another, it might be argued that these familial units did not conform to Benedict Anderson's concept of "imagined communities" in its strictest interpretation. In addition, it is crucial to acknowledge my own inclination towards the study of these suboptimal civilizations, which I wholeheartedly endorse to anyone with a vested interest in scrutinizing diasporic connections. From a research perspective, examining real groups has distinct advantages in terms of analysis and psychology, making them very relevant in social contexts compared to hypothetical and nonexistent organizations. The objective of my artistic endeavor is to illustrate the manner in which familial networks can engender opposing attachment emotions. They serve as a point of attachment, analogous to the way in which an individual is connected to sustenance. In alternative terms, they comprise the fundamental basis of an individual. These families not only establish the social, emotional, and physical mobility of its members, but also function as networks of global pathways. The network of routes serves as a means to disseminate information regarding probable trip destinations. As a network of sources, they offer insights into the psychosocial dimensions of individuals' travel encounters, encompassing their levels of security or unease. This raises the question of mobility and its correlation with the examination of migration. Here is another fundamental proposition that I felt compelled to investigate thoroughly. What is the underlying rationale for the assumption that the role of mobility holds inherent importance in the examination of diasporic cultures? This has incited me to contemplate an additional crucial inquiry: what form of mobility is intrinsic to the establishment of the diasporic state?

#### **MIGRATION AND EXISTENTIAL MOBILITY**

Movement on both the physical and existential levels. In addition, this link makes it possible to construct a comprehensive framework in the subject of social physics, with a particular emphasis on socio-existential mobility. This framework aims to differentiate between the various manifestations of mobility, rather than conflating them under a single term that fails to acknowledge the distinctions between the movement of vulnerable, displaced, and uncertain refugees and the movement of carefree tourists who feel completely at ease in their surroundings. This is because the singular term fails to acknowledge the distinctions between the movement of



vulnerable, displaced, and uncertain refugees and the movement of carefree tourists who feel completely at ease in their surroundings. This aha moment occurred in the later part of 2002 while the traveler was in Boston. My updated field notes on the following ethnographic topics are as follows: My cousin Elie, who works with my family's business, was questioned about whether or not he had any interest in going back to Lebanon. Recently, he showed me his brand-new eating establishment. In issue is a person who, along with his siblings, has achieved a large amount of success in the field of entrepreneurship. Together, they manage a vast network of Lebanese dining facilities that can be found all over the urban landscape. The person drove us in his "toy," which was a black utility vehicle with four wheels and a variety of additions. This vehicle had a large size and exceptional features, and it was the vehicle that the man used to carry us. The individual conveyed a sincere need to relocate back to the hamlet, but he or she mentioned a lack of satisfaction in their life in Lebanon as a reason to not do so. This individual believed that moving back to Lebanon would be pointless because it lacked importance. After that, he asked a hypothetical inquiry, wondering, "For what purpose do you desire my return to that location?" he posed the question in hypothetical form. In Lebanon, people are said to be "whahad byerkud, byerkud, w' byib'a matrahu," which translates to "constantly traversing their surroundings and ultimately returning to the point from which they started." His statement suggests that working at this company gives one a feeling that they are making headway and moving in the right path. This person was driving his pickup truck at a pace of approximately 87 miles per hour (which is comparable to 140 kilometers per hour) when he made this comment, providing credence to his assertion that he was "en route to a specific destination." The remark that existence possesses "a taste" denotes the presence of importance and intentionality in the minds of Lebanese people because of their cultural tendency to place a high value on gastronomic experiences. A life devoid of sensory stimulation, also known as "hayeht bala ta'meh," is defined by a lack of importance or purpose and can sometimes be described as "hayeht bala ta'meh." In addition to this, Elie underlined that in order to have a profound sense of meaning and purpose in one's life, one must have a clearly defined direction to follow. In the Lebanese language, the term that is used to mean "moving well" is also used to signify "functioning well," similarly to how the term is used in the English language and in a number of other languages. The statement "I am well" in Lebanese is "mehcheh'l haal," which literally translates to "the condition of my existence is in motion." This is also a possible

translation of the phrase. It is clear from the aforementioned words that expressions such as "walking," "going somewhere," "running," and others like them do not apply to the physical act of moving one's body. Existential mobility and the capacity for an existence to continue on have been hypothesized to have some kind of relationship with one another. Migration, which includes essential physical mobility, seems to have an inverse relationship with existential mobility, as deduced from the judgments that individuals make of their own motives for travel. This is the case because migration involves needed physical mobility. When an individual's existential mobility is in a state of crisis, the only time they will often consider making a physical move is when they find themselves in a desperate situation. When an individual feels as though they are not advancing at a sufficient speed or as though they are not making any progress at all, they will begin to contemplate the necessity of engaging in physical activity. The feeling that they have reached a dead end on the "journey of life" inspires them to look for other options. The awareness of motion is, without a question, an indispensable component in the process of imputing meaning and purpose to one's life. The concept of "moving forward towards a destination" does not include the concept of "returning to a location that was visited in the past." The concept of viability is inextricably linked to the chronological advancement of development. As a result of this quality, it is frequently associated with ideas that pertain to the "future," as opposed to those that are tied to the present or the past. In point of fact, one of the most widespread schools of thought concerning the viability of migration centers on the concept of the future as its primary justification for existing in its present form. In Lebanon, there are almost no positive possibilities for the future, which is a significant aspect that contributes to the country's generally poor quality of life. A large number of people have voiced their hopes and dreams for a brighter and more positive future.

## CONCLUSION

Although some non-anthropologists may accuse me of favoring anthropology, I have consistently discovered that no other field of study is as well-suited as ethnographic analysis for understanding the intricate nature of these social phenomena when it comes to the study of globalization, migration, and mobility. I have devoted a considerable amount of time to reviewing a wide range of scholarly publications on the

topic of migration and diaspora, which is one of the main reasons I am so knowledgeable in this area. I can therefore impart a plethora of expertise on the topic. In contemporary times, it is becoming more and more important to have a dual perspective—that is, one that integrates knowledge of the social context in which many cultures exist with a thorough depiction and analysis of a wide range of cultural experiences. This is a result of the world we inhabit in getting more intricate and varied. To put it simply, the representation must be able to incorporate both the concrete realm of human experience and the broad macro-level systems that lie outside of individuals' direct comprehension. To sustain this dual perspective throughout time, the most effective method is to use reflexive ethnographic research. In order to increase the amount of ethnographic research being done in this specific subject, I have assessed the analytical depth of the main issues that were examined in this essay. The use of these ideas without careful consideration has the potential to both help and hinder people's ability to understand specific social phenomena in the area because of how fascinating and pertinent they are to modern aspects of our interconnected global society. This can be attributed to the intricate interconnectivity of our worldwide community. The author's perception of the possible advantages of conducting empirical research has been illustrated in this post. The development of theoretical frameworks and the improvement of analytical abilities are two of these advantages.

## REFERENCES

Anderson, Benedict (1983) *Imagined Communities: Reflections on the Origin and Spread of Nationalism*. London and New York: Verso Press.

Bashkow, Ira (2004) 'A Neo-Boasian Conception of Cultural Boundaries', *American Anthropologist* 106(3): 443–58.

Bourdieu, Pierre (1993) *The Field of Cultural Production*. Oxford: Polity Press.

Castles, Stephen (2002) 'Migration and Community Formation under Conditions of Globalisation', *International Migration Review* 36(4): 1143–68.

Friedman, Jonathan (2002) 'From Roots to Routes: Tropes for Trippers', *Anthropological Theory*2(1): 21–36.

Friedman, Jonathan (2004) 'Globalisation', in David Nugent and Joan Vincent (eds) *A Companion to the Anthropology of Politics*. Oxford: Blackwell Publishers.

Grillo, Ralph (2001) 'Transnational Migration and Multiculturalism in Europe', in *Working Papers Series of Transnational Communities Program*, edited by Ali Rogers, published on line at [http://www.transcomm.ox.ac.uk/working\\_papers.htm](http://www.transcomm.ox.ac.uk/working_papers.htm) (accessed August 2005).

Gulick, John (1953) 'The Lebanese Village: An Introduction', *American Anthropologist* 55(3): 367–72.

Marcus, George (1998) *Ethnography Through Thick and Thin*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press

Nabti, Patricia (1992) 'Emigration from a Lebanese Village: A Case Study of Bishmizzine', in Albert Hourani and Nadim Shehadi (eds) *The Lebanese in the World: A Century of Emigration*. London: The Centre for Lebanese Studies in association with I.B. Tauris.

Parry, Jonathan (2003) 'Nehru's Dream and the Village "Waiting Room": Long-Distance Labour Migrants to a Central Indian Steel Town', *Contributions to Indian Sociology*(n.s.) 37(1 & 2): 217–49.